

# APPRENTICESHIP AS A DEGREE ATTAINMENT STRATEGY FOR THE EARLY CHILDHOOD WORKFORCE

**Alison Lutton** (AUTHOR) | **Published September 2018**

DISTRICT 1199C  
**Training &  
Upgrading  
Fund**



100 South Broad Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19110  
215-568-2220 | [www.1199ctraining.org](http://www.1199ctraining.org)



Copyright © 2018 by Philadelphia Hospital and Health Care District 1199C Training & Fund. All rights reserved. This document or any portion thereof may not be reproduced or used in any manner whatsoever, except for brief quotations reproduced for scholarly and/or educational purposes, without the express written permission of the District 1199C Training & Upgrading Fund.

**Printed in the United States of America. First Edition, 2018.**

District 1199C Training & Upgrading Fund | 100 S. Broad Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor, Philadelphia PA 19110 | [www.1199ctraining.org](http://www.1199ctraining.org)

[this page intentionally left blank]

# APPRENTICESHIP AS A DEGREE ATTAINMENT STRATEGY FOR THE EARLY CHILDHOOD WORKFORCE

by **ALISON LUTTON** | published **SEPTEMBER 2018**

## Contents

	<b>Page #</b>
Acknowledgements...	... 2
Introduction...	... 3
Background...	... 4
Early childhood educator training, education, compensation and stratification...	... 4
National research, policy and financing recommendations...	... 7
The Pennsylvania ECE Apprenticeship Program...	... 9
The Apprenticeship Project Design...	...10
The Degree Partner...	...12
Looking Ahead...	...13

## Appendices

Appendix 1: REFERENCES...	...15
Appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF APPRENTICESHIP PROJECTS...	...20

District 1199C  
**Training &  
Upgrading  
Fund**



100 South Broad Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19110  
215-568-2220 | [www.1199ctraining.org](http://www.1199ctraining.org)

# acknowledgements

## **thank you:**

The District 1199C Training & Upgrading Fund would like to thank the Pennsylvania Department of Education for its support of this paper as part of the Innovative Programs for Pennsylvania's Early Childhood Education Workforce grant.

The author would also like to thank colleagues who shared their expertise through interviews and correspondence, especially Mary Alice McCarthy of New America; Adele Robinson of the University of Maryland School of Public Policy; members of the National Association of Early Childhood Specialists in State Departments of Education who contributed information for the national chart of ECE apprenticeship projects; and especially the apprentices, employers and project staff whose participation in project events informed this paper.

## **about the author:**

Alison Lutton is a national consultant providing support and technical assistance to early childhood education leaders and project teams including research, consultation, materials development and review, and strategic planning with a focus on professional and workforce systems development in early childhood education.

## **about the training fund:**

The District 1199C Training & Upgrading Fund is a Philadelphia-based labor/management work-force development partnership, established in 1974 to serve as an educational resource for 50+ local healthcare and human services employers and the District 1199C local affiliate of the National Union of Hospital and Health Care Employees (NUHHCE).

The Fund's community-serving educational programs include adult basic education, English as a second language, occupationally-contextualized high school equivalency and Bridge courses, and job training in six health and human services career pathways: allied health, behavioral health, community health, nursing, health information and early childhood education. Over the last four decades, the Training Fund has helped connect over 100,000 Delaware Valley residents of all ages and incomes to career paths in health and human services.

# introduction

---

**Over** the past three decades, research has established that early childhood education, from birth through approximately age eight, lays foundations that are critical to long-term success in school and life. High quality early learning environments and adult child interactions grounded in an understanding of most effective practices and most important goals in developmental and learning trajectories at each stage—infant-toddler, preschool and early grades—are key to positive child outcomes. Consequently, the quality of teaching practice is the key to high quality early education programs and specialized professional training and education is the key to high quality teaching practice.

By 2000, this understanding was translated into policies that expected more intensive and specialized training for early childhood educators including a mix of associate and bachelor degrees for lead teachers in Head Start and in early learning programs accredited by the National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC). Today it is fueling a national call for a bachelor degree with specialized early childhood content and practice for all lead educators working with children from birth through age eight (IOM 2015). While change is needed to improve early education from birth through grade 3, this paper is focused on the preschool sectors, where current public funding and policies result in poverty level teacher wages, poor job quality, high staff turnover, and lack of career advancement opportunities that has historically stymied efforts to improve teacher practice, education, and compensation.

A number of important questions arise as states and communities decide how to invest in and set timelines for the transition to higher degree expectations for early educators working in settings that have not historically required undergraduate degrees or teacher licensure. Data on the early childhood workforce in Pennsylvania indicates state data quite similar to national data. This paper looks at the potential of the Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program to:

- 1. Build** partnerships between early learning programs, training organizations and higher education programs to better prepare early educators, especially strengthening infant, toddler and preschool course content and field experiences
- 2. Develop** strategies that address concerns about whether a degree requirement for lead teachers will exacerbate the racial, class and linguistic inequities and stratification that already characterize the early education workforce
- 3. Advocate** for funding and policy changes that will be needed to address inequities in compensation, job quality, and access to and preparation for college success and support retention of degreed teachers in child care and Head Start Settings
- 4. Adapt** the registered apprenticeship framework to fit the current realities of child care employers and staff, ensure high quality on the job learning, accelerate degree completion for incumbent teachers, and sustain the program over time

The content of this paper reflects the first year of the project, which began with an early commitment from the Community College of Philadelphia to collaborate in the design of a higher education model for early childhood apprenticeships. The project has since expanded to nearby Chester and Delaware counties in partnership with Delaware County Community College.

# background

---

## >>> Early childhood educator training, education, compensation and stratification...

**TRAINING & EDUCATION:** As early childhood education has grown in its reach—with 60% of all children enrolled in some form of non-parental care before kindergarten and the majority of those attending a child care center or prekindergarten—greater attention has been placed on the quality of early childhood education and its value to society (Corcoran, 2017). Nearly 2 million early childhood educators, 95.6% women, provide early care and education to 12 million children before they begin school (NSECE 2013, Gould 2015).

Decades of research consistently find that high quality early education programs lead to positive outcomes for children from early “brain building” through later school and adult life. It is clear that the teacher is the key to quality and that specialized preparation for teaching young children from birth through age eight, along with continuing professional development, is the key to high quality teaching practice in the early years (IOM, 2015, p. 6).

Recognizing that “empirical evidence about the effects of a bachelor’s degree is inconclusive,” the *Transforming the Workforce* report recommended a “transition to a higher level of education as a minimum requirement” based on evidence from the science of child development and learning which indicates that teachers of infant, toddler and preschool children need a level of knowledge and competence similar in sophistication to that of elementary teachers. (IOM, 2015, p. 7) Required qualifications should be based on both interdisciplinary and specialized early education competencies. Federal government agencies and nongovernmental resources organizations; state leadership, licensure and accreditation agencies, state and local stakeholders, and institutions of higher education “should collaboratively develop a multiyear, phased, multi-component, coordinated strategy to set the expectation that lead educators who support the development and early learning of children from birth through age 8 should have at a minimum a bachelor’s degree and specialization in the knowledge and competencies needed to serve as a care and education professional. This strategy should include an implementation plan tailored to local circumstances, with coordinated pathways and timelines for changes at the individual, institutional, and policy levels” (IOM, 2015, p. 513).

The quality and capacity of current early childhood degree programs has also been a concern, especially at the bachelor level. The *Transforming the Workforce* report includes multiple recommendations with many pages of specific detail describing necessary improvements in both bachelor degree programs and ongoing professional learning for early educators. Teacher education across certification areas has a long history of research and recommendation reports examining the quality of teacher preparation and urging innovation and change. That research has examined many topics including whether a baccalaureate level education is sufficient for profession licensure, whether teacher education is sufficiently grounded in child and adolescent development, whether academic standards for admission into teacher education programs should be lifted, the shortage of higher education faculty qualified to teach in specific certification areas (including early childhood education), the shortage of teachers of color and teachers who are fluent in multiple languages, and challenges in state funding and institutional capacity that affect the development and delivery of teacher education programs.



Of particular interest in this context is the body of research that recommends increasing time for and sophistication of what is usually called student teaching to move closer to clinical models such as those used in nursing and other health professions. Calls for improving teacher education have long included recommendations to better integrate theory and practice through earlier and more intensive field practice for students with more faculty time in the field (NCATE 2010). Well-designed apprenticeship programs could contribute to the larger body of knowledge emerging from Professional Development Schools, residencies, “grow your own teachers” programs, and other job-embedded, college-school partnership models of teacher education.

A recent study found that professional development for teachers already working in the field is most effective when it is focused on specific curriculum content; incorporates active learning embedded in the context of practice; creates time and space for teachers to collaborate with peers; offers a clear vision of and models high quality teaching practice; provides coaching and expert support tailored to individual needs; supports reflection, feedback and change in teaching practice; and is sustained for enough time to learn, explore, implement and change practices (Darling-Hammond, Hyler, Gardner 2017).

Apprenticeships have a long and international history, but in the United States are rarely integrated into public education at high school and college levels. They are rarely seen as a pathway into professional white-collar jobs or as a structure for integrating academic learning with application through reflective practice under the supervision of a skilled mentor. While apprenticeships are sometimes promoted as an alternative to a college education, they can also be promoted as another format for a college education. In the second model, apprenticeship “should be delivered by the higher education community, like community colleges, and it should connect to bachelor’s degrees” (Redden, 2017).

**COMPENSATION, EQUITY AND STRATIFICATION:** Early educators working in child care have a national median hourly wage of \$10.31, almost 40% below other occupations, and one in seven (14.7%) live below the official poverty line . Only 15% of child care teachers receive health insurance. (Gould 2015) The National Early Childhood Workforce Index for 2018 from The Center for the Study of Child Care Employment looked at 2010-2015 change in child care wages and compared child care wages to the median wage for all occupations in each state. Child care wages decreased in the majority of states while “preschool teacher” wages increased. Wages varied by program type and by age of children taught, with teachers working in child care programs earning less than preschool, Head Start and early grade school teachers; and teachers working with infants and toddlers earning less than those working with older children. In all states child care teachers made less than two-thirds of the median for all occupations in their state in 2015. The individual state profiles reported no change in the median wage for Pennsylvania’s child care teachers since 2015, holding at \$9.71 per hour. Preschool teachers saw a small 1% increase over the same time (Whitebook, MacLean, Austin & Edwards, 2018, p19-20 and State Profiles).

A 2008 study of California’s early childhood teachers found that while the workforce as a whole was very diverse in ethnicity, language and age it was “significantly stratified by educational level and job title.” Family child care providers and center-based assistant teachers were “considerably more likely to be women of color—i.e., other than “white, non-Hispanic”— and more linguistically diverse than were center-based teachers or center directors. Diversity among center directors, who needed the highest qualification levels in the state, was

comparable to diversity among K-12 teachers. “Those who had attained the highest level of education—for example, center-based teachers with bachelor’s degrees—were significantly less diverse than other groups” (Whitebook, 2008, p. 2-5).

Reduced workforce diversity in roles with higher degree requirements is a concern across professions. A 2008 national survey of registered nurses (RNs), who must hold either an associate or bachelor’s degree in nursing and pass a national exam, found that 83.2% of RNs were non-Hispanic white. (Phillips, 2014) A number of initiatives to recruit and retain underrepresented groups are underway focused on providing academic, financial and mentoring support prior to admission and during nursing preparation programs as well as building a more effective pipeline to increase the diversity among nurse faculty. (Elfman, 2018) Similarly, data for K12 school teachers, who must hold a bachelor’s or post-bachelor’s degree and pass state exams, found that 72% of all bachelor degree students, 75% of all teacher education majors, and 82% of all K12 teachers working in public elementary and secondary schools were non-Hispanic white. While there was a slight increase in teachers of color between 1988 and 2012, the percentage of teachers who are black decreased slightly in the same period. Multiple efforts are underway to recruit and retain more teachers of color (U. S. Department of Education, 2016).

Many early childhood advocates hope that lifting educational requirements will result in higher compensation. The 2013 National Survey of Early Care and Education (NSECE) found that while wages did increase with education level, wages for early childhood educators with a BA were still much lower than for BA holders in other occupations. Even within early education, teachers working with children under age 3 were paid less than those working with children age 3 to 5 even when both held a BA. (NSECE 2013) While teachers of older children make more than teachers of younger children and K12 teachers make more than preschool teachers, in no state do K12 teachers make as much as other college graduates in the same state (Allegretto & Mishel, 2016).

Nationally, degree completion data indicate that persistent systemic and structural racial, class, gender and linguistic inequities plague our underfunded education system from preschool through post-secondary education. 2016 data on bachelor degree completion by adults in their late twenties found that 43 percent of whites, 23 percent of blacks, 19 percent of Hispanics and 10 percent of Native Americans held a bachelor degree or higher . Fifty-four percent of whites, 32 percent of blacks, 27 percent of Hispanics, and 16.5 percent of Hispanics held an associate’s degree. (NCES, 2018) Low compensation, lack of benefits, and staff turnover create significant barriers to increasing the training and education levels for early educators working in child care settings (Howes, Whitebook & Phillips, 1998; Howes, Whitebook & Phillips, 2014).

While efforts are underway to lift qualifications and require a specialized early childhood baccalaureate degree for all lead teachers in birth through age 8 early education programs, this effort will require intentional planning, investment and ongoing monitoring of goals and timelines using benchmarks that include goals related to B8 PD system integration, PD quality assurances, equity and workforce diversity, and compensation parity across B8 sectors and settings (NAEYC 2016).



### >>> National research, policy and financing recommendations...

While there is significant consensus among ECE policy advocates around requiring a BA for lead teachers in all early education programs, there is also significant debate and discussion about what exactly that means and how it might be achieved. A series of national reports have offered recommendations to guide investment in initiatives that can lift early educator compensation, address workforce inequities, and improve teaching practice and qualifications.

- “Major funding resources for child care and early childhood education should set aside a dedicated portion of funds to support initiatives that jointly improve the qualifications and increase the compensation and benefits” for early educators (NRC & IOM, 2000, p. 8)
- Because compensation is so low, “the incumbent ECE workforce should bear no cost for increasing practitioners’ knowledge base, competencies, and qualifications, and the entering workforce should be assisted to limit costs to a reasonable proportion of postgraduate earnings, with a goal of maintaining and further promoting diversity in the pipeline of ECE professionals” (NAS 2018)
- Higher education programs should be funded “to develop faculty and ECE programs and to align ECE curricula with the science of child development and early learning and with principles of high-quality professional practice. Federal funding should be leveraged through grants that provide incentives to states, colleges, and universities to ensure higher-education programs are of high quality and aligned with workforce needs, including evaluating and monitoring student outcomes, curricula, and processes” (NAS 2018)
- While teacher education reports have long called for more professional development schools, clinical practice faculty, and other models of job embedded learning, closer and more strategic partnerships between higher education programs and schools will require changes in program structure, faculty staffing and financing that will not happen without specific investment (NCATE, 2010)

A number of initiatives over the past two decades have focused on increasing degree retention and completion rates especially for students that face specific barriers. While there have been some successes in degree completion overall, “the gap in degree attainment between white and Hispanic students has remained unchanged [and] disparities between white and black students have grown slightly. The same problems hold true for other underrepresented groups. Low-income, first-generation students are nearly four times more likely than their peers to drop out after their first year.” Part of the problem appears to be that many of the current national and state initiatives are designed for full time students but first generation students and students of color are more likely to attend college part time (Mangan, 2018).

Targeted universalism has emerged as a useful way to work toward a universal goal—such as a bachelor degree in early childhood education for all lead teachers working with children from birth through age 8 in all early learning settings—while developing targeted strategies that pay particular attention to equity and social justice issues. In this approach, universal goals are achieved through targeted approaches designed for specific groups, developing and sustaining policies and programs that are equitable for all. One group may need ESL supports and at least some teacher education in a language other than English. Students who are returning to college after decades or who did not experience academic support and success in high school may need adult basic education and college prep courses, with developmental coursework linked to content from their desired major. Working adult students may need a degree program that can accelerate completion through online and job-embedded course learning. Working class, first

generation college students and students of color may need student mentors and counselors who share their cultural backgrounds and can help navigate both the practical and identity challenges that come with entry into the culture of college and the professions. Targeted universalism recognizes that each group can achieve the universal goal only through specific strategies based on their needs and circumstances (Powell, Menendian & Reece, 2009).

The Power to the Profession initiative led by fifteen national organizations that represent members working inside the profession of early childhood education is currently working through a series of discussion and decision cycles to build consensus on some of the thornier questions in preparation for a policy campaign to lift qualifications, compensation and public investment in the early childhood workforce. Among these are questions about how to increase degree requirements in ways that will reduce rather than exacerbate the existing inequities in compensation and in opportunities for career advancement especially for early educators working in child care and Head Start settings. A closely related question is to what extent increased qualifications should be required—as distinct from incentivized and supported—without significantly increasing compensation (NAEYC, 2018).

# the pennsylvania early childhood apprenticeship program

---

**Early** childhood apprenticeships are not new. The earliest is generally considered to be the West Virginia apprenticeship for Child Development Specialists founded in 1989. Apprenticeships for early educators are currently operating in at least eight states today. (Appendix 2, National Chart of Apprenticeship Projects) The Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program stands out in the national landscape for its particular mission and its integration of lessons learned from the experience of applying the registered apprenticeship framework to the current realities of early childhood education. As a result, it is breaking new ground.

The project began in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania in the context of a city-wide early childhood initiative. A new city beverage tax enabled the Philadelphia Mayor's Office of Education to launch an initiative to create 6,500 new quality prekindergarten seats for the city's 3- and 4-year old children in 2016. Simultaneously, a collaborative regional project produced a report on local early educator recruitment, retention and preparation along with a set of "gold standards", recommendations for teacher preparation programs that focused on improving 1) the quality of teacher preparation especially for work with infants and toddlers and 2) access and supports for full-time workers and nontraditional learners. The recommendations included earning accreditation from the NAEYC Commission on the Accreditation of Early Childhood Higher Education Programs, and many of the Gold Standards aligned well with accreditation criteria. Three local associate degree programs and two locally available online programs were already accredited. Another had begun the accreditation process and was conducting their program review and self-study.

Initial partners include:

- The **District 1199C Training & Upgrading Fund** (the Training Fund) is a labor-management partnership that brings extensive experience in workforce development, registered apprenticeships, adult education, "bridge" programs for college entry, and professional development for early educators. The Training Fund acts as an apprenticeship intermediary for the project. Recognizing the capacity challenges that face both child care employers and higher education, the Training Fund took the lead in project design ensuring compliance with federal and state registered apprenticeships, provides college preparation and advising not already provided by

the higher education partner, and leverages related private and public workforce development funding and other supports. Project participants are employed in union and non-union workplaces.

- **Community College of Philadelphia** (CCP) has a well-established early childhood associate degree program that enrolls apprentices, provides college coursework and student services, and supports the apprentices' progress toward successful degree completion. CCP provides course mapping, financial and admissions services, and faculty advising for apprentices as individuals and as cohorts.
- **First Up**, a Philadelphia-based early childhood training, advocacy and technical assistance organization that provides training and ongoing support to the onsite coaches—degreed co-workers of the apprentice who provide and assess on the job learning opportunities related to competencies aligned with national competency standards of the profession (NAEYC Standards for Early Childhood Professional Preparation, 2009) and with CCP college coursework.

### >>> The Apprenticeship project design...

**CREDENTIALS, DEGREES & CAREER PATHWAYS:** The early childhood profession has suffered from a proliferation of state, local, and sector specific competencies, standards and credentials that limit the ability of early educators to transfer and stack certificates and credentials in ways that can lead to career advancement. Few of these credentials are portable and carry value across multiple employers, across early learning setting types, and states. Knowing this, the Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program decided to focus on a pathway that recognizes 1) completion of the national Child Development Associate (CDA) credential, and 2) leads to completion of an early childhood associate degree that has transfer agreements with early childhood BA programs, most of which lead to Pennsylvania's Pre-K and early grade teacher licensure.

While apprenticeships typically partner with or are sponsored by the adult education or workforce divisions of colleges, this goal meant that the Pennsylvania Apprenticeship Project partners with faculty, student support staff, and administrators in academic divisions of higher education institutions. The apprenticeship intermediary, the Training Fund, works closely with higher education partners to ensure the project design both meets registered apprenticeship requirements and is compliant with state teacher licensure and national professional preparation accreditation requirements.

The career pathway for apprentices begins with obtaining the CDA credential, which can be earned during high school, following high school, or as an incumbent child care worker. Successful completers who earn the national CDA credential are eligible for the apprenticeship programs. If they go on to enroll at Community College of Philadelphia they will receive 9 credits for three early childhood courses whose course outcomes are comparable to CDA competencies and training topic areas. An additional 9 credits for three different early childhood courses is awarded for on the job learning that is assessed by worksite job coaches. As they progress through the apprenticeship program they complete additional courses and receive wage increases. When they complete the associate degree they are upgraded from Apprentice to Journeyperson. At that point they may enroll in an early childhood bachelor degree program that leads to Pennsylvania's Prekindergarten through 4th grade early childhood teacher certification.

**ON-THE-JOB LEARNING COMPETENCIES, CURRICULUM & QUALITY:** Rather than developing various sets of on the job competencies for specific employers or early education sectors, the Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program developed a single, shared on-the job-learning curriculum based on competencies aligned with the 2009 NAEYC Standards for Professional Preparation. These standards are used by the NAEYC Commission on the Accreditation of Early Childhood Higher Education Programs, by the Council for Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP), and by many state agencies that regulate early childhood teacher preparation programs. As a result, they can be organized into progress through clusters of on the job learning competencies that are tightly aligned to early childhood college course outcomes, increasing the number of credits that can be earned through on the job learning hours and accelerating degree attainment for part time students.

Because Pennsylvania has a statewide program-to-program associate to baccalaureate articulation agreement, transfer is based on completion of the associate degree program as a whole and not on matching individual courses. There are many advantages to agreements based on demonstrated student outcomes at program completion rather than on one-to-one course matching, (Loewenberg, 2018) including the potential to embed apprenticeships into the degree program without disrupting transfer agreements. Current partner institutions of higher education hold regional accreditation and their early childhood associate degree programs either hold current national programmatic accreditation from the NAEYC Commission on the Accreditation of Early Childhood Higher Education Programs or are progressing through the process of earning that accreditation. Together, state oversight of teacher education programs and articulation agreements along with national accreditation from the profession provide a framework for oversight of degree program quality across all delivery modes, including on the job learning.

**SPECIAL CHALLENGES FOR EMPLOYERS IN THE CHILD CARE SECTOR:** Early childhood apprenticeships are typically designed for the child care sector of early education although many include Head Start as well as public and private school staff. The Pennsylvania ECE Apprenticeship Project recognized the capacity issues that challenge childcare programs and, as a result, often limit the enrollment and retention of apprentices and their employers. Due to the fragmented and underfunded nature of the field, these capacity issues include the large number of small employers working with very tight budget margins, the lack of administrative support to manage the responsibilities of the employer sponsor role in registered apprenticeships, limited onsite professional development capacity, and limited ability to raise wages for already very low wage employees. The Pennsylvania ECE Registered Apprenticeship Project is designed to address these challenges, with the Training Fund as the apprenticeship intermediary, taking on the responsibilities of program sponsor of a multi-employer registered apprenticeship partnership program. The apprenticeship intermediary conducts outreach, recruitment, and provides ongoing support to employers and apprentices.

Because employers in the child care sector face a shortage of teaching staff who are qualified and willing to take on the responsibilities of coaching apprentices and assessing their learning, the Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program partners with a local provider of training and technical assistance to child care programs (First Up) to provide an additional layer of coaching. These external coaches work with and support the onsite mentor teachers using the project's shared curriculum and competencies framework and the Coaching with Powerful Interactions resources (Jablon, Dombro, Johnsen, 2016). The workforce apprenticeship intermediary organization is responsible for compliance with federal and state



registered apprenticeship requirements and takes a lead role in coordination across all project partners—employers, apprentices, onsite mentors, external coaches, as well as early childhood faculty and staff at the partnering institutions of higher education.

**WORKFORCE DIVERSITY, EQUITY & COMPENSATION:** The project is designed to respond to the national goal of specialized, birth through age 8, early childhood education degree attainment for lead teachers and is permeated with a focused commitment to reduce rather than exacerbate workforce stratification and inequity. While all employers are welcomed and encouraged to participate in the program, special recruitment efforts were made to reach smaller programs, high poverty neighborhoods, first generation college students, and teachers of color in partnership with the Philadelphia Mayor’s Office of Education Philadelphia Quality PreK initiative. The apprenticeship intermediary, the Training Fund, and the early childhood degree program at CCP worked to address barriers to college success including financial support for tuition and other college costs, academic support for college entry and placement testing, ESL support, and personal coaching to navigate the college campus and processes.

All registered apprenticeships include step wage increases in an “earn as you learn” model. The Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program negotiated four wage steps with each employer based on program milestones that include hours worked, satisfactory progress with on the job competencies, course credits earned and degree attainment. As the apprenticeship intermediary agency, the Training Fund monitors apprenticeship progress and related wage steps. Registered apprenticeships require on the job coaching from other employees at the apprentice’s worksite. The Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program established standard requirements for coach qualifications and expectations. On the job coaching is performed during paid time and coaches receive a stipend for the additional responsibilities that come with apprentice meetings and documentation of apprentice competencies. Pennsylvania apprentices are able to use the state’s T.E.A.C.H. scholarships, which also require an annual wage increase or bonus at the completion of each scholarship year.

### **>>> The degree program partner...**

**COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA:** The degree program partner for the project’s design and start up, Community College of Philadelphia (CCP), is a large institution with many years of experience serving students underrepresented in higher education. The majority of students, 73%, receive financial aid, and a majority are over 25 years of age. The student population is 61% women and 75% minority with approximately 52% of students African American, 13% Hispanic/Latino, and 9% Asian/Pacific Islander (CCP website). There are approximately 600 students currently enrolled in early childhood education with 100 graduates in 2018. The apprenticeship project commitment to support part time, first generation college students, adults working full time in low-income jobs, and teachers of color is a good fit for the mission of the CCP early childhood program.

**CURRENT EVIDENCE-BASED PRACTICES IN STUDENT RETENTION, SUPPORT & SUCCESS:** CCP has been participating in the national Achieving the Dream project since 2006 and has incorporated a number of current best practices in higher education into its student supports and degree programs. The large number of apprentices made it possible to organize two cohorts with similar backgrounds, one cohort of students who already had completed some

college coursework and a second cohort of students new to college. A course map was designed for each cohort and individual course maps were developed for each apprentice after a review of the CDA credentials, and transcripts from CCP and other institutions of higher education. The cohort group with first time college students was large enough to enable the college to schedule special sections of general education courses for ECE students. These included special sections with courses restricted to apprenticeship enrollment, and general education coursework contextualized for early childhood education. For example, one English course uses a book on play in early education as its primary text.

Apprentices must meet college admission and minimum placement testing requirements. CCP and the apprenticeship intermediary organization, the Training Fund, work as partners to support college preparation and entry for the apprentices. The Training Fund provides college preparation and “bridge” coursework, facilitates study groups, and assigns a personal counselor to support apprentices as they enter and navigate the higher education system. The Training Fund counselor, who serves as the apprenticeship program coordinator, works closely with the CCP academic advisor to ensure student success in coursework and that the apprentices stay on track towards graduation. While CCP is an open admissions institution that accepts all students, these supports from the Training Fund are essential to many front line early educators who need additional support to prepare for college entry and success in college level courses. CCP provides academic advising, tutoring, transcript reviews, cohort course scheduling, graduation mapping, and financial aid advising including a partnership with the Pennsylvania T.E.A.C.H. scholarship program. CCP and the Training Fund communicate regularly to monitor and support the apprentices as college students.

**PROGRAM CURRICULUM:** Apprentices complete the same degree program as other CCP early childhood majors. Courses earned through on the job learning competencies and assessments are aligned with standard course outcomes, which are in turn aligned with national standards of the early childhood profession—currently the 2010 NAEYC Standards for Initial Early Childhood Program Accreditation.

Different course maps were designed for each apprentice cohort and for already matriculated individual apprentices to guide them through a course sequence that will result in completion of the associate degree program in two and a half years, completing a mix of on campus courses and courses earned through on the job competency assessments in each semester. The CCP associate degree program requires a total of 62 credits. Thirty-four of these are child development or early childhood education credits. Apprentices complete 3 early childhood courses (9 credits) through on the job competency learning and assessment. Another three courses (9 credits) can be earned through successful completion of the national CDA assessment. Early childhood faculty work with the Training Fund and the apprentice coaches to monitor and ensure the integrity of competencies documented and courses earned through on the job learning.

**>>> Looking ahead...**

**DEGREE COMPLETION:** The Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program’s targeted universalism approach supports higher education degrees in early childhood education for all early educators in lead teaching roles and adds focused supports to address many of the equity barriers that face low income working adults, first generation

college students, and students of color. The project's first years have been designed for cohorts of incumbent early childhood teachers who already hold a current CDA and are working in positions that do not currently require associate or bachelor degrees. The two cohorts that began in 2017 included students who were already enrolled at Community College of Philadelphia and had successfully completed some of the courses required in the degree program. Five of those apprentices graduated in spring of 2018 with an average GPA of 3.5. The rest of the apprentices who began in 2017 are expected to graduate in December 2018, May 2019, December 2019, and May 2020 depending on whether they started the apprenticeship program with college credits. There are currently 33 apprentices and 25 employers participating in the project. The program has a 90% retention rate in its second year.

**COMPENSATION INCREASES:** The apprentices are also recipients of T.E.A.C.H. scholarships, which require a stipend or bonus at the end of each scholarship year. During the first three months of the program apprentice wages increased an average of \$.42 per hour. The program expects an average wage increase of \$2 to \$3 per hour from acceptance as an apprentice to completion of the associate degree (Friedlander, 2018). While this meets and exceeds the T.E.A.C.H. requirement and is a significant raise for teachers making \$9 to 10 per hour, it is not sufficient to recruit and retain degreed teachers over time. The Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program partners are also partners in state and national efforts to increase public funding for early childhood education across the child care, Head Start, prekindergarten and public K-12 school systems with some of that funding earmarked to improve teacher salaries and job quality. Improvements in wages and job quality are important goals of the apprenticeship project partners.

**EXPANSION & REPLICATION:** Expansion and replication of the Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program model requires skilled program leadership including fundraising to cover project implementation, reporting, and evaluation. Implementation skills include employer recruitment and retention, negotiating salary increases and on the job mentoring; identification of project partners, contracting, payment, oversight and data collection; apprentice recruitment, registration and retention; coordinating with higher education partners to provide academic advising and career counseling, access to financial aid, adult basic education as needed, preparation for placement testing, tutoring, study groups, and counseling; and project contracting, compliance and reporting including facilitation of an employer-led Apprenticeship Committee as required by federal and state registered apprenticeship programs (Friedlander, 2018).

The Training Fund has been contacted by local, state and national organizations interested in expanding or replicating the project. Delaware County Community College is enrolling new apprentice cohorts, resulting in the on-boarding of new employer partners, in two neighboring counties to Philadelphia, Delaware and Chester counties, with classes and on the job learning scheduled to begin in September of 2018. A statewide conference with national guests is scheduled for September 2018.

Future cohorts could be designed for apprentices new to the profession, including the development of a pre-apprenticeship program in partnership with high school Career and Technical Education cohorts. Continuing the targeted universalism approach, expansion and replication would likely include adaptations in the design to take advantage of strengths and address challenges specific to new higher education partners, new apprentice and new employer communities. Degree completion with simultaneous and significant increases in compensation will remain a core commitment of the project.

The Pennsylvania Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program holds promise as a model that can make progress toward the goal of specialized degree completion for all lead early educators, provide targeted supports for specific groups of current and future teachers, raise compensation, and build partnerships to strengthen the capacity and quality of early childhood degree programs.



# appendix 1

---

## >>> REFERENCES...

Allegretto, S., Mishel, L. 2016. The teacher pay gap is wider than ever. Washington, DC: Economic Policy Institute. Retrieved June 28, 2018 from <https://www.epi.org/publication/the-teacher-pay-gap-is-wider-than-ever-teachers-pay-continues-to-fall-further-behind-pay-of-comparable-workers/#epi-toc-7>

Center for the Study of Child Care Employment (CSCCE). 2018, April 23. [Opportunity, Access, and Respect for Early Educators](http://cscce.berkeley.edu/opportunity-access-and-respect-for-early-educators/). Berkeley, CA: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment. Retrieved April 16, 2018 from <http://cscce.berkeley.edu/opportunity-access-and-respect-for-early-educators/>

CAEP 2018. Standard 2. Retrieved June 19, 2018. <http://caepnet.org/standards/standard-2>

Community College of Philadelphia student data retrieved June 27, 2018 from [http://www.achievingthedream.org/college\\_profile/705/community-college-of-philadelphia](http://www.achievingthedream.org/college_profile/705/community-college-of-philadelphia) and <https://www.ccp.edu/about-us/key-facts>

Corcoran, L., and Steinley, K. (2017). *Early Childhood Program Participation, From the National Household Education Surveys Program of 2016* (NCES 2017-101), National Center for Education Statistics, Institute of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education. Washington, DC. Retrieved [April 23, 2018] from <http://nces.ed.gov/pubsearch>.

Darling-Hammond, L., Hyler, M. E., Gardner, M. (2017). *Effective Teacher Professional Development*. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute. <https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/product/effective-teacher-professional-development-report>

Elfman, L. 2018, February 25. Meeting Nursing Demand Through Diversity. *Diverse Issues in Higher Education*. Retrieved May 23, 2018 <http://diverseeducation.com/article/110965/>

Friedlander, Amy. 2018. Philadelphia Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program: Support for the ECE Workforce and the Children They Teach. Philadelphia Public Health Management Corporation: Early Childhood Action Collective. <http://ecactioncollective.org/images/ECE-Apprenticeship-Program.pdf>

Gould, Elise. 2015. Child Care Workers Aren't Paid Enough to Make Ends Meet. Economic Policy Institute. <https://www.epi.org/publication/child-care-workers-arent-paid-enough-to-make-ends-meet/>



Howes, C., Whitebook, M., & Phillips, D.A. 1992. National Child Care Staffing Study. *Child & Youth Care Forum*, 21(6): 399-414 <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/BF00757371> , [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/226031230 Teacher characteristics and effective teaching in child care Findings from the National Child Care Staffing Study](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/226031230_Teacher_characteristics_and_effective_teaching_in_child_care_Findings_from_the_National_Child_Care_Staffing_Study)

Howes, C., Whitebook, M., & Phillips, D.A., 1998. *Worthy Work, Unlivable Wages: The National Child Care Staffing Study, 1988-1997*. University of California, Berkeley: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment. <http://cscce.berkeley.edu/worthy-work-unlivable-wages-the-national-child-care-staffing-study-1988-1997/>

Howes, C., Whitebook, M., & Phillips, D.A., 2014. *Worthy Work, STILL Unlivable Wages: The Early Childhood Workforce 25 Years After the National Child Care Staffing Study*. University of California, Berkeley. Center for the Study of Child Care Employment. <http://cscce.berkeley.edu/worthy-work-still-unlivable-wages/>

Jablon J., Dombro, A., Johnsen, S. 2016 *Coaching with Powerful Interactions: A Guide for Partnering with Early Childhood Teachers*. Washington, DC: National Association for the Education of Young Children.

Loewenberg, A. 2018. *Using Articulation Agreements to Help Early Childhood Educators Pursue a BA*. Washington, DC: New America. Retrieved August 29, 2018 from <https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/reports/ensuring-smooth-pathway/using-articulation-agreements-to-help-early-childhood-educators-pursue-a-ba>

Mangan, K. 2018, April 30. *Want to Close Achievement Gaps? Focus on Part-Time Students*. Washington, DC: The Chronicle of Higher Education. Retrieved June 28, 2018 from. <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Want-to-Close-Achievement/243272>

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (NAS). 2018. *Transforming the Financing of Early Care and Education*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. doi: <https://doi.org/10.17226/24984>.

National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC). 2009. *NAEYC Standards for Early Childhood Professional Preparation*. Position Statement Approved by the NAEYC Governing Board. Washington, DC: National Association for the Education of Young Children. Retrieved August 29, 2018 from [https://www.naeyc.org/sites/default/files/globally-shared/downloads/PDFs/resources/position-statements/2009%20Professional%20Prep%20stdsRevised%204\\_12.pdf](https://www.naeyc.org/sites/default/files/globally-shared/downloads/PDFs/resources/position-statements/2009%20Professional%20Prep%20stdsRevised%204_12.pdf)

National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC). 2016. [\*Build It Better: Indicators of Progress to Support Integrated Early Childhood Professional Development Systems\*](#). Washington, DC: National Association for the Education of Young Children. Retrieved April 26, 2018 from <https://www.naeyc.org/our-work/initiatives/profession>

National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC). 2018. Power to the Profession resources. Washington, DC: National Association for the Education of Young Children. Retrieved April 26, 2018 from <https://www.naeyc.org/our-work/initiatives/profession>

National Center for Education Statistics (NCES), "Percentage of Persons 25 to 29 Years Old with Selected Levels of Educational Attainment, by Race/Ethnicity and Sex: Selected Years, 1920 through 2016." Retrieved May 23, 2018 from [https://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/d16/tables/dt16\\_104.20.asp](https://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/d16/tables/dt16_104.20.asp)

National Council for the Accreditation of Teacher Education (NCATE). 2010. Transforming Teacher Education Through Clinical Practice: A National Strategy to Prepare Effective Teachers. Retrieved June 19, 2018 from <http://www.highered.nysed.gov/pdf/NCATECR.pdf>

National Research Council (NRC) and Institute of Medicine (IOM). 2015. *Transforming the workforce for children birth through age 8: A unifying foundation*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press.

National Research Council (NRC) and Institute of Medicine (IOM). 2000. *From Neurons to Neighborhoods: The Science of Early Childhood Development*. Committee on Integrating the Science of Early Childhood Development. Jack P. Shonkoff and Deborah A. Phillips, eds. Board on Children, Youth, and Families, Commission on Behavioral and Social Sciences and Education. Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press. <https://www.nap.edu/catalog/9824/from-neurons-to-neighborhoods-the-science-of-early-childhood-development>

Pennsylvania Early Childhood Apprenticeship program components and replication toolkit. <http://1199ctraining.org/ECEReplication>

Philadelphia Mayor's Office of Education, Quality PreK program. <https://beta.phila.gov/departments/mayors-office-of-education/quality-pre-k/>

Phillips, Janice M., Malone, B. 2014 Jan-Feb. Increasing Racial/Ethnic Diversity in Nursing to Reduce Health Disparities and Achieve Health Equity. Public Health Rep.129 (Suppl 2): 45–50. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3863700/>

Powell, j., Menendian, S., Reece, J. 2009. The Importance of Targeted Universalism. In the March/April 2009 issue of Poverty & Race. Retrieved June 28, 2018 from [http://www.prrac.org/full\\_text.php?text\\_id=1223&item\\_id=11577&newsletter\\_id=104&header=Miscellaneous&kc=1](http://www.prrac.org/full_text.php?text_id=1223&item_id=11577&newsletter_id=104&header=Miscellaneous&kc=1)

Redden, E. 2017, August 8. Importing Apprenticeships. Inside Higher Ed. Retrieved June 19, 2018. <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2017/08/08/interest-grows-us-germanswiss-model-apprenticeships>

U.S. Department of Education, 2016. July. The State of Racial Diversity in the Educator Workforce. Policy and Program Studies Service, Office of Planning, Evaluation and Policy Development. Retrieved May 23, 2018 from <https://www2.ed.gov/rschstat/eval/highered/racial-diversity/state-racial-diversity-workforce.pdf>

Whitebook, M., Kipnis, F. & Bellm, D. 2008. *Diversity and stratification in California's early care and education workforce*. Berkeley, CA: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California at Berkeley.  
[http://cscce.berkeley.edu/files/2008/diversity\\_stratification08.pdf](http://cscce.berkeley.edu/files/2008/diversity_stratification08.pdf)

Whitebook, M. Phillips, D. & Howes, C. 2014. [Worthy Work, STILL Unlivable Wages: The Early Childhood Workforce 25 Years after the National Child Care Staffing Study](#). Berkeley, CA: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California at Berkeley. Retrieved August 29, 2018 from <http://cscce.berkeley.edu/worthy-work-still-unlivable-wages/>

Whitebook, M., McLean, C., and Austin, L.J.E. (2016). Early Childhood Workforce Index - 2016. Berkeley, CA: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California, Berkeley. Retrieved from <http://cscce.berkeley.edu/files/2016/Early-Childhood-Workforce-Index-2016.pdf>

Whitebook, M., McLean, C., Austin, L.J.E., & Edwards, B. (2018). Early Childhood Workforce Index: 2018. Berkeley, CA: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California, Berkeley. Retrieved from <http://cscce.berkeley.edu/topic/early-childhood-workforce-index/2018/>. Related State Profiles retrieved from <http://cscce.berkeley.edu/2018-index-state-profiles/>



## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>California, Los Angeles</b> SEIU Early Educator Training Center – <i>sponsor</i> Mexican American Opportunities Foundation (MAOF) Child Care Resource Center (CCRC), Los Angeles Trade Tech College (LATTTC) YMCA of the East Bay - Early Childhood Impact in Northern California and other Head Start employers	SEIU launched the ECE apprenticeship project in 2016. The Head Start partnership launched in 2018.	<u>Credential:</u> advancement on the CA Child Development Permit Matrix. <u>Compensation:</u> increases as professional targets are met	3 projects target different employer groups 1. Center based employers in southeast Los Angeles 2. Home based child care employers in San Fernando and Antelope Valleys in Los Angeles County 3. Head Start employers	Center-based child care Family Child care providers Head Start teachers Predominantly women of color, ranging in age from mid 20's to mid 60's, mostly Mexican-American and recent immigrants, and working mothers. There are plans to support kinship care providers (i.e., license exempt) to become licensed and enter the Apprenticeship.
<a href="http://seiearlyeducatortraining.org/early-educator-apprenticeship/">http://seiearlyeducatortraining.org/early-educator-apprenticeship/</a> <a href="http://seiearlyeducatortraining.org/2016/11/26/groundbreaking-apprenticeship-program-targets-child-care-crisis/">http://seiearlyeducatortraining.org/2016/11/26/groundbreaking-apprenticeship-program-targets-child-care-crisis/</a> <a href="https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/edcentral/head-start-apprenticeship-california-helps-child-care-workers/">https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/edcentral/head-start-apprenticeship-california-helps-child-care-workers/</a>				

## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Florida, Manatee &amp; Pasco counties</b> 1. The Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program / Child Care Apprenticeship Program of Manatee County Partners: Manatee Technical College (MTC) and the Florida Department of Education		<p><u>Credential:</u> State of Florida Completion of Apprenticeship certificate as a Child Care Development Specialist, equivalent to a Child Care Development Associate, meets Florida child care teacher requirements</p> <p>Up to 9 credits towards AAS/AS degree in Early Childhood Education at State College of Florida or up to 9 credit hours in Early Childhood Education program at other FL public colleges.</p>	<p><u>Curriculum:</u> Program length is 288 hours of classroom training and 4,000 hours (two years) of on-site supervised work experience.</p> <p>Classes meet in the evening as students must be employed by a child care agency while in training.</p>	<p>Apprentices must be employed in a participating employer child care center, have a high school diploma or GED®, and complete the application form for submission to the apprenticeship committee. The application is obtained through the participating center and submitted to the committee through the coordinator.</p> <p>Applicants do not apply through MTC.</p>



## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Florida</b> 2. Child Care Apprenticeship Program of Pasco County Partners: Marchman Technical College		<u>Credential:</u> ECPC Early Childhood Professional Certificate CCAC Child Care Apprenticeship Certificate Apprentices may receive up to half credit for program hours based on desired prerequisites and a credit assessment. <u>Compensation:</u> no information on website	<u>Curriculum:</u> weekly evening classroom instruction with on-the-job training and support. The program is tuition free. Program Total Hours: 4288.	Students must be currently employed in the early childhood field and have a high school diploma or GED to be eligible for the program.
<a href="http://manateeetech.edu/career-prep/early-childhood-education-apprenticeship/">http://manateeetech.edu/career-prep/early-childhood-education-apprenticeship/</a> <a href="https://www.daytonastate.edu/hchs/ece.html">https://www.daytonastate.edu/hchs/ece.html</a> - apprenticeship coordinate listed but no project information available on website <a href="http://mtec.pasco.k12.fl.us/?page_id=232">http://mtec.pasco.k12.fl.us/?page_id=232</a>				

## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Kansas</b> , Early Childhood Associate Apprenticeship Program (ECAAP) Partners Department of Commerce Department for Children and Families	Funded with the state's Child Care and Development Block Grant. At the end of FY16, Department of Children and Families declined to renew their contract with ECAAP program. ECAAP program became integrated with the Kansas Registered Apprenticeship program. There were no CCDBG funding projections for FY17.	Credentialed: <u>Compensation</u> : The average wage for all apprentices is \$ 10.28 per hour. 4 new apprentices registered in fiscal year 2016 had an average starting wage rate of \$8.55 per hour. 7 program completers in fiscal year 2016 had an average completion wage rate of \$ 10.84.		45 registered apprentices and 25 active apprentices in fiscal year 2016
<a href="http://www.dcf.ks.gov/services/ees/Documents/Child_Care/FY2016-2018Submitted_CCDF_StatePlan-ConditionallyApproved.pdf">http://www.dcf.ks.gov/services/ees/Documents/Child_Care/FY2016-2018Submitted_CCDF_StatePlan-ConditionallyApproved.pdf</a> <a href="http://www.kansasworkforceone.org/pdf/Kansas-Annual-Report-PY15FY16-10-3-16.pdf">http://www.kansasworkforceone.org/pdf/Kansas-Annual-Report-PY15FY16-10-3-16.pdf</a> p. 33				

## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Maine</b> Apprenticeship Program for the Early Care and Education field in Maine  Maine Shared Services Alliance (MSSA) serves as intermediary agency. MSSA is a project of the Kennebec Valley Community Action Program (KVCAP)  Partner: Maine Roads to Quality (MRTQ), Maine's Professional Development Network	Approved and registered on July 2, 2018 by the Maine Department of Labor	<u>Training partners:</u> Higher Ed and Maine Roads to Quality (MRTQ), our Professional Development Network.  Support to onsite mentors: Mentors and Employers will be trained by MRTQ in order to assure appropriate separation of supervisory roles. Mentors will participate in monthly Community of Practice meetings facilitated by MRTQ.	MSSA will be responsible for much of the administrative work on behalf of its members.  Currently membership is free to the ECE field once they have enrolled on the MSSA website. That website holds information and documents for a restricted group. MSSA retains all required documentation.	Currently enrolling employers, mentors and apprentices to participate in a Pilot Project in Cumberland County.
<a href="http://www.sharedservicesforme.org">www.sharedservicesforme.org</a>				

## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Missouri, St. Louis</b> LUME Institute's Early Childhood Apprenticeship Program in St. Louis – professional development institute St. Louis Agency on Training and Employment (SLATE) – <i>Sponsor</i>	Pilot began in April 2016, continuing in 2018 St. Louis, MO SLATE provides financial support for training St. Clair County Intergovernmental Grants Department	<u>Credential:</u> CDA and Department of Labor Certificate and 9 college credits that can be applied to BA programs <u>Compensation:</u> Wages begin at \$9.50/hour and lift to \$12-13/hour over two years	LUME names these worksite partners in 2018: Southern Illinois University Edwardsville East St. Louis Center (Head Start and Early Head Start); and University City Children's Center (developed the LUME Professional Development Institute)	Unemployed or underemployed workers Anyone 18 or older with high school diploma or GED and criminal background check. Must pass WorkKeys assessment in reading, math and locating information
<a href="https://www.lumeinstitute.org/lume-career-pathway/">https://www.lumeinstitute.org/lume-career-pathway/</a> <a href="https://www.stlouis-mo.gov/government/departments/slate/documents/lume-early-childhood-apprenticeship.cfm">https://www.stlouis-mo.gov/government/departments/slate/documents/lume-early-childhood-apprenticeship.cfm</a>				



## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Oregon</b> Head Start Parent Apprenticeship Program		<p><u>Credential</u>: Child Development Associate certificate (CDA).</p> <p><u>Compensation</u>: no information on website</p>	Head Start assigns apprentices to classrooms during apprenticeship period	Current or previous Head Start parents are hired as Classroom Assistants in training in the Head Start classrooms. Eligibility requirements include a high school diploma or GED; English proficiency; background check; TB test; food handling, CPR and First Aid certification
<a href="http://www.ode.state.or.us/teachlearn/pte/prkns4perfmeasccte_seconly10_02_12.pdf">http://www.ode.state.or.us/teachlearn/pte/prkns4perfmeasccte_seconly10_02_12.pdf</a> - pdf is from 2012 <a href="http://www.nhpdx.org/WhatWeDo/headstart_23_4282008396.pdf">http://www.nhpdx.org/WhatWeDo/headstart_23_4282008396.pdf</a>				



## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Pennsylvania</b> ECE Apprenticeship 1199c Training & Upgrading Fund- <i>sponsor</i> Community College of Philadelphia First Up Mayor's Office of Education Philadelphia Health Management Corporation	Started in 2016 Funding sources are not listed on website	<u>Credential</u> : Associate's degree in early childhood education <u>Compensation</u> : no information on project website <u>Curriculum</u> : competency based curriculum standardized across employers and aligned with national standards of the profession and with partner degree program course outcomes	Open invitation but no information about eligibility or current partners on project website	Project described as CDA to Associate degree. CDA is required before beginning the apprenticeship. Sponsor offers CDA training.
<a href="https://www.ccp.edu/about-us/news/news/new-apprenticeship-philadelphia-strengthens-education-early-learners">https://www.ccp.edu/about-us/news/news/new-apprenticeship-philadelphia-strengthens-education-early-learners</a> <a href="https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/edcentral/quality-and-equity-one-approach/">https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/edcentral/quality-and-equity-one-approach/</a> and <a href="https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/policy-papers/rethinking-credential-requirements-early-education/">https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/policy-papers/rethinking-credential-requirements-early-education/</a> - suggests apprenticeship as alternate to BA, cites Philadelphia project <a href="https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2017/10/the-crisis-facing-americas-preschool-teachers/544002/">https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2017/10/the-crisis-facing-americas-preschool-teachers/544002/</a> and <a href="https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/edcentral/our-take-new-paper-rethinking-credential-requirements-early-education/">https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/edcentral/our-take-new-paper-rethinking-credential-requirements-early-education/</a> - suggests apprenticeship as path to a BA, problem of low compensation and affordability, cites Philadelphia project				

## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Vermont, statewide</b> 1. Vermont Child Care Apprenticeship Program, statewide Vermont Child Care Industry and Careers Council (VCCICC) Employers - <i>sponsors</i>	Each employer, apprentice and mentor pays a \$25 annual membership fee	<p><u>Credential:</u> Application for a Child Development Associate Credential (CDA) in year 1. Certificate of Completion and may apply for a Vermont Level IIIA certificate upon completion of year 2. 18 college credits earned through 6 college courses.</p> <p>Compensation: college courses are tuition-free with no cost for textbooks.</p>	<p>Worksite mentors must meet experience and education requirements, commit to the training program, participate in a full day no-cost training, and participate in support activities organized in their region. Mentors are eligible for up to \$100 in professional development funds.</p> <p>Employers are each sponsors responsible for assigning a qualified mentor. VCCICC organizes worksite mentor group meetings.</p>	<p>Apprentices must be working in regulated child care, pass the tests to get into CCV courses and pay a small fee and the cost of books.</p> <p>Apprenticeship courses are offered around the state.</p> <p>Apprentices identify potential employers through the VT Dept. of Labor website and use spreadsheets to code their work hours in each competency area.</p>

## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Vermont, statewide</b>  2. Teacher Apprenticeship Program, Champlain College  NOTE: Early Childhood education is not listed as an available endorsement option for apprentices  <a href="https://www.champlain.edu/career-success/career-transition-apprenticeship-program/frequently-asked-questions">https://www.champlain.edu/career-success/career-transition-apprenticeship-program/frequently-asked-questions</a>		<p><u>Credential:</u> Vermont Teaching License for completers who meet state licensure requirements</p> <p><u>Compensation:</u> no compensation mentioned on project website. Tuition is \$11,900, due prior to program. An additional \$500 fee funds honorarium for two mentors. There is also a \$100 non-refundable application fee. Grant and loan information at <a href="http://www.vtac.org">www.vtac.org</a></p>	<p>Apprentices do student teaching in K12 schools.</p>	<p>Apprentices must hold a bachelor's degree, with a strong concentration in courses related to the endorsement sought and relevant professional or life experience.</p> <p>Over 500 completers teaching in Vermont, 20 more in other states or overseas.</p>
<a href="http://northernlightscdc.org/career-pathways/early-childhood-pathways/vermont-child-care-apprenticeship-program">http://northernlightscdc.org/career-pathways/early-childhood-pathways/vermont-child-care-apprenticeship-program</a>  <a href="http://www.vtchildcareindustry.org/apprenticeship.html">http://www.vtchildcareindustry.org/apprenticeship.html</a>  <a href="https://www.nga.org/files/live/sites/NGA/files/pdfs/2016/1602WorkforceInvestmentStrategiesWalker.pdf">https://www.nga.org/files/live/sites/NGA/files/pdfs/2016/1602WorkforceInvestmentStrategiesWalker.pdf</a>  <a href="http://www.champlain.edu/career-success/career-transition-programs/teacher-apprenticeship-program">http://www.champlain.edu/career-success/career-transition-programs/teacher-apprenticeship-program</a> - teacher cert. apprenticeship				



## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Virginia, statewide</b> Project Pathways Registered Apprenticeship Program Child care employers - <i>sponsors</i> Project Pathways and Pathfinders Scholarships		<p><u>Credential:</u> Community college credits towards a certificate of associate's degree and "a nationally-recognized Certificate of Completion."</p> <p><u>Compensation:</u> Employers pay progressively higher wages at the end of each apprenticeship year, determined by each employer and as skills increase.</p> <p>Pathfinders scholarships cover tuition, books and fees for college courses cover.</p>	<p>Employers are responsible for hiring or selection of apprentices and mentors, identifying skills and knowledge to be learned, providing on the job training, setting and implementing wage progression.</p> <p>Employers and apprentices apply by contacting their regional Department of Labor Registered Apprenticeship Consultant, then contacting the Pathfinders Scholarship Advisor.</p>	<p>Apprentices may be new hires or current employees working at least 30 hours a week.</p>
<a href="http://www.vecf.org/project-pathfinders/">http://www.vecf.org/project-pathfinders/</a> <a href="http://www.vecf.org/registered-apprenticeship-materials/">http://www.vecf.org/registered-apprenticeship-materials/</a>				

## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>Washington</b> 1. State ECE apprenticeship 2. Southwest Washington Child Care Consortium <i>no project websites found</i>	WA State ECE Apprenticeship, permanently registered in 1999, URL below indicates standards updated in 2017. SW WA Child Care Consortium, permanently registered in 2006, URL below indicates standards updated in 2017.	Credential: Compensation: <i>no project websites found</i>	<i>no project websites found</i>	<i>no project websites found</i>
<a href="http://www.lni.wa.gov/TradesLicensing/Apprenticeship/files/standards/0632.pdf">http://www.lni.wa.gov/TradesLicensing/Apprenticeship/files/standards/0632.pdf</a> <a href="http://www.lni.wa.gov/TradesLicensing/Apprenticeship/files/standards/1813.pdf">http://www.lni.wa.gov/TradesLicensing/Apprenticeship/files/standards/1813.pdf</a> <a href="http://www.lni.wa.gov/tradeslicensing/apprenticeship/files/pubs/occupationlisting.pdf">http://www.lni.wa.gov/tradeslicensing/apprenticeship/files/pubs/occupationlisting.pdf</a>				

## appendix 2: NATIONAL CHART OF ECE APPRENTICESHIPS

State, geographic range project name, partners, URL	Length of operation, funding sources	Curriculum, training & learning supports, credential earned, pay increases	Worksite/employer partners & supports	Apprentices, eligibility & supports
<b>West Virginia, statewide</b> West Virginia Apprenticeship for Childhood Development Specialist (ACDS) River Valley Child Development Services Early Childhood Training Connections & Resources County Vocational Technical Centers County High Schools.	Established in 1989, first early childhood apprenticeship in the United States. Partners include US Dept. of Labor, Office of Apprenticeship WV Dept. of Education, Division of Technical and Adult Education Services; Dept. of Health and Human Resources, Office of Social Services;	<u>Credential:</u> ACDS and Department of Labor Journey person certificates with option to continue to associate degree program. Some WV community colleges award course credit based on the ACDS certificate. <u>Compensation:</u> No information on project website	Participants include Child Care Providers, Head Start programs, In-Home Providers, Preschools, Public Schools, Youth programs and Home Visiting programs	Apprentices submit on the job training hours and supervisor evaluations. ACDS publishes a quarterly newsletter for apprenticeship participants
<a href="http://www.wvacds.org">http://www.wvacds.org</a> <a href="http://www.wvacds.org/Newsletter.html">http://www.wvacds.org/Newsletter.html</a> https://bellwethereducation.org/sites/default/files/Bellwether_HeadStartWorkforce.pdf - recommends job-embedded PD, WV in references				



[this page intentionally left blank]

by **ALISON LUTTON** | Published **SEPTEMBER 2018**

# APPRENTICESHIP AS A DEGREE ATTAINMENT STRATEGY FOR THE EARLY CHILDHOOD WORKFORCE

Copyright © 2018 by Philadelphia Hospital and Health Care District 1199C  
Training & Fund. All rights reserved.

DISTRICT 1199C  
**Training &  
Upgrading  
Fund**



100 South Broad Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19110  
215-568-2220 | [www.1199ctraining.org](http://www.1199ctraining.org)